Jobs for local workers. Much of the arts industry may be labor-intensive. Unless those jobs are held by local residents, and unless purchases are made from local firms, which in turn employ local residents, the potential for increased jobs locally as a result of increased demand for local arts activities may be more illusionary than true. Both of the preceding examples cast doubt on the potential of significant local employment.

Empirically, little is known about how the arts compare to other service industries as far as contributing to import substitution. Studies of the economic impact of the arts almost totally ignore the import needs of the local arts industry. This is a major failing of the empirical work because new growth for the local economy can result from either increased exports or reduced imports.

The work by Kelejian and Lawrence holds considerable promise for investigating many of the industry linkages in a major city where much of the arts sector undoubtedly is a part of the faster growing service sector.

The Role of the Arts in Developing Countries: Thailand, A Case Study

Mary Connelly Mabry
and
Bevars D. Mabry

BY ITS NATURE, economic development is a process of change by which behavior patterns and activities are altered to permit and assist an expansion of resources, output, and wealth. A society is prone to development if its culture accommodates change at a pace sufficient to sustain the augmentation of resources.[1] To the extent that a people identify with the traditional culture, its values, institutions, and morality, they may be unable to appreciate and reluctant to adopt the rationale of new forms of social organizations required by the new technology. This resistance affects the rapidity with which a society is capable of adapting to the demands of a new technology, and this capacity to adapt may be as important to economic development as the acquisitions of capital and the supporting infrastructure.[2] Unless strongly held traditional values can be preserved, so that cultural identity is not lost, a society may not become "modernized." Cultural identity can be preserved if symbolisms are developed that link the new with the past. It is here that the arts function as an agent in economic development.

Development literature has recognized cultural barriers, but it has not incorporated these barriers into a formal model, nor has it dealt uniquely with the role of the arts as an element influencing the size of the barriers. Conceptually, the contribution of the arts could be measured if their influence on the barriers could be specified. To the extent that resources are devoted to the arts and the arts impede or enhance cultural receptivity to development, then economic growth along a time path will be accelerated or retarded. Given the cost of "investment" in the arts, an internal rate of return can be calculated from the differential rate of growth over the time path.

The maturity of the arts can influence development in a number of ways. Negatively, consumption to satisfy aesthetic values can divert resources from more productive uses and thereby lessen the growth rate. Wealth can be accumulated in art forms rather than in capital goods and perpetuate a climate hostile to

growth and change. Yet the arts can also enhance productivity. The demand for art as a form for giving homage, showing respect, and paying tribute may stimulate productivity. If, for example, art encourages and promotes creativity, it may facilitate the acquisition and development of technology, a search for the solution of problems, and it may lead to the development of entrepreneurship. If an appreciation for creativity is encouraged, if the exploration of new ideas and themes is permitted, the arts may provide a climate for change. Indeed, art, expressed in product and architectural designs, may stimulate the demand for goods by translating traditional tastes into modern ones and hence making the latter more acceptable.

THE ROLE OF ART IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF THAILAND

Traditional art in Thailand, as in much of Asia, is basically hieratic, mixing religious and mythological themes. Artists were anonymous in the oriental and medieval tradition, and their efforts were literally dedicated to superior workmanship, not to their own creative, original expression.[3]

Thailand's ethnic identity began with the Sukhothai Kingdom (thirteenth to fourteenth centuries) and remained relatively static throughout the succeeding Ayuddhya and Bangkok Kingdoms. Belief systems, religious dogmas, and technology were essentially fixed, and not until the nineteenth century, when slavery and corvée were abolished, did Thai social structure undergo change. Indeed, even though changes accelerated after World War II, 80 percent of the population are still peasant rice farmers utilizing traditional farming techniques and 90 percent are Theravada Buddhists, whose adherence to their faith is well documented. Therefore, there were few inducements to evolve new art forms. Emphasis was placed upon exact, imitative reproductions of received forms, not creativity, originality, or individual expression.

Attributable in part to this underdeveloped sense of artistic pride, demand for artists and their products was weak (Feroci 1954, p. 284). This lack of appreciation for the aesthetic quality in art extended not only to new forms of expression but also to existing art objects. Buddhist dogma holds that in the "making of merit," one's store of merit, and hence one's status in future reincarnations, is determined by the net value of all one's good and bad deeds. Good deeds, or moral behavior, involve among other things creating new tributes to the Buddha, such as the construction of a new temple or the addition of a new image. Much more merit is earned through additions than through the preservation of existing objects. Together with the fact that religious objects were considered essentially utilitarian in nature, this perception contributed to a lack of concern with preserving art objects.[4] Also, the costs of preservation were high because of the impermanence of the materials used in a tropical climate. Wood rots; stone crumbles; frescoes fade from heat, sunlight, and mildew. Hence, making new objects was not much more costly than preserving old ones, and with the added merit they conveyed, more marginal utility per outlay resulted from allocations of resources to the new. The consequence of this lack of preservation has been a depleted store of ancient art treasures.

Production, then, of religious artifacts became primarily a function of their rate of real depreciation. In the Bangkok period, beginning in the first half of the eighteenth century, tile began to replace wood as roofing material, and the longevity of temples and their contents was extended. The corveé obligation also acted as a disincentive to the highly skilled craftsman. Such workmanship was likely to be "rewarded" by compulsory service in a noble's court. The artisan found himself uprooted and separated from home, family, and friends (Ingram 1971, pp. 58–63). The quality of life and the real income of the farmer were greater than those of the artisan. Hence, artisanship became a low-status occupation among ethnic Thais, and the quality of workmanship reflected this status. Indeed, kings and nobility seeking craftsmanship in the nineteenth century were compelled to import alien Chinese, who supplied the level of desired skills and who eventually, with their superior skills, replaced Thai artisans (Skinner 1957, pp. 8–117).

THE RENAISSANCE OF CLASSICAL ART

The European imperialist push into Indochina in the last century profoundly affected the course of development of Thailand and its perception of art. Thailand emerged in the middle of the nineteenth century as a neutral buffer state between the British in the east and the French in the west. In part, it achieved détente with Britain in the Bowring Treaty of 1852 because it was able to display a stable culture that appeared to be civilized, perhaps not in the modern sense but in an exotic, aesthetic sense. However, the succeeding kings of Thailand realized that to maintain independence the country would have to display to the outside world a capacity for modernization. In addition, the kings recognized that the kingdom would have to be strengthened internally by developing among the people a clearer sense of national identity, by abolishing the divisive institutions of corvée and slavery, by assimilating the aliens, and by weakening the power of vassal lords. Nation building involved strengthening the identification of the populace with their common roots in the Buddhist church, their cultural heritage, and the inextricable role of the crown in the continuity of both of these traditions. The traditional art of Thailand symbolized the common heritage of the people and thus emerged as a recognized instrument in the development of a Thai identity.

As the society focused upon these distinctive elements of Thai culture, intrinsically the elements became more highly valued. Indeed, tradition has tended to be strengthened as a unifying force among the Thai in direct proportion to any increased external threat to national autonomy. Yet the need to modernize the economy in order to acquire the resources sufficient to defend Thai autonomy

from such external threats generates pressures for change within the society. External threats, then, give rise to pressures both for and against change within Thai society.

The renaissance of traditional Thai art in the twentieth century has in part emanated from foreign threats and occupation. The post-world-war period witnessed a major expansion in the collection, preservation, and reemergence of her classical art. Museums were established throughout the country to collect, preserve, and promote interest in Thai arts and crafts. Silpakorn University of Fine Arts was established to preserve and foster classical architecture, sculpture, music, drama, and the dance, and to develop Thai archaeology. Performances by university artists are frequently given in the ornate National Auditorium, an architectural gem in the Thai tradition that adjoins the university. Hence, both the supply of artists and the demand for art have been concurrently promoted. The ruins of ancient capitals and cultural centers have been archaeologically explored and restored. Universal, compulsory education has been introduced, and Thai children imbued with a sense of national identity through instruction in Thai history, religion, and art. Thus, the Thai art market has expanded.

Thailand has sought to develop her economy from both internal and external sources of capital. Foreign capital has flowed into Thailand in huge amounts because of the stability of Thai culture and commitment to private enterprise. This stability has aided the process of modernization. Modernization, by exposing Thailand to the rest of the world, has stimulated interest in the most visible form of her culture, that is, her art. Along with this influx of capital has come an army of foreign technocrats, and Bangkok has become a major stop on international air routes. During the Vietnam War thousands of American soldiers and their families were stationed in Thailand, and thousands of soldiers on leave visited Bangkok annually. Tourism in Thailand has become a major industry and a major earner of foreign exchange. Between 1961 and 1975 the annual number of visitors to Thailand increased more than tenfold to almost 1,200,000, and annual tourist expenditures increased over sixteenfold to 4.1 billion baht (20 baht equal U.S. $1.00).

Tourism has literally resurrected Thai crafts. Villages near Chiengmai, each specializing in different crafts—woodcarvings, lacquerware, parasols, pottery, tribal jewelry—produce for the tourist trade and are stops on sight-seeing tours. The design and making of fine jewelry, using Thai gems, has become a major industry, and tourists supplement the domestic market. Art dealers and a large, resident, international population frequent antique and artifact stores and have enlarged the market for teak and rattan furniture, celedon ceramics, and bronze cutlery. Graduates of Silpakorn University of Fine Arts are employed in numerous restaurants as performers of classical dance and music. Tourists visit the sites of the ancient cities of Sukothai, Ayuddhya, and Pimai, and in suburban Bangkok a precise, reduced-to-scale replica of Thailand's most historic structures can be viewed at the "Ancient City." Charcoal rubbings from carved stone friezes of temples provide tourists with inexpensive replicas of mural art. Silk

decorated with traditional designs is also available. Thus, Thailand markets her ancient culture well.

Modernization through the development of the road, educational, and utility infrastructure has brought ethnic Thais into greater contact with their cultural heritage. Merchandisers in the mass market use traditional symbols to make their products acceptable. Expanding incomes have increased the demand for artifacts. New structures are being designed, built, furnished, and decorated to house the burgeoning factories, the growing number of shops and stores, and multinational corporate staffs.

Institutions of higher education, including schools of fine arts, have increased their enrollments, and Thai government scholarships have financed the education of thousands of art students in advanced Western countries, particularly the United States. By the end of the Third Five Year Plan in 1976, enrollments in the performing arts had increased to 600 from 400 in 1972, and enrollments in other art programs had increased to 2,000 from 1,500 in 1972. A design development program was established in 1969 to improve the standards in product design for both the domestic and export markets (Sponaugle 1972, pp. 15–18, 28, 29). The program not only trains commercial artists in production design but also solves the design problems of local industry, incorporating the solutions into the actual products that are marketed. A large number of the designs utilize traditional Thai patterns. One type of commercial art that has received international recognition is the gigantic billboard poster. Painted by anonymous Thai artists, the posters advertise current films and utilize a compositional style not unlike those in temple mural art.

> The posters' immense scale and clarity of presentation resemble what is known in the West as Pop Art. Both American Pop Artists and Thai poster artists display violence, folk heroes, calendar girls, and other popular themes. While [Thai poster art] shares scale, impact, and directness with American pop art, its aesthetic approach is eclectic, derived partly from its own culture and borrowed in part from the West.'

Poster artists are trained on the job, are fine craftsmen, and usually are employed by the cinema showing the advertised film.

The dimensions of the art sector in the Thai economy can be revealed by the number of professional artists and artisans in the labor force. This information for 1970 is presented in Table 1. Professional artists comprised about 10 percent of the 280,000 professional workers in the country, and artists in traditional crafts represented about 13 percent of the 1.1 million craftsmen and production workers. Males predominated among professional artists; females comprised the larger proportion of artisans. Although 45 percent of professional artists were employed in Bangkok-Thonburi, only 19 percent of the artisans worked there. About 7 percent of the population of 3.4 million people lived in Bangkok-Thonburi, and about 30 percent of the population was engaged in nonagricultural employment.

Table 1. *Artists and Selected Artisans in Thailand, 1970*

Professional Artists	Whole Kingdom Total	Male	Female	Bangkok-Thonburi Total	Percent of Kingdom
Architects and Engineers	2,774	2,415	359	1,693	61.03
Sculptors, Painters, Related Artists	8,884	7,762	1,212	3,998	45.00
Authors, Journalists, Writers	1,839	1,524	315	1,426	77.54
Actors, Musicians, Performing Artists	15,559	10,600	4,959	5,999	38.56
Total	29,056	22,211	6,845	13,116	45.14
Artisans					
Spinners, Weavers, Knitters, Dyers, etc.	55,955	10,825	45,130	16,194	28.94
Jewelers, Goldsmiths, Silversmiths	15,146	11,306		7,360	48.59
Glass Formers, Potters, Clay Workers	29,615	15,652	13,963	3,128	10.56
Basketry Weavers	43,062	15,857	27,205	1,112	2.58
Total	143,778	53,640	90,138	27,794	19.33

Source: National Statistical Office (1973).

CONCLUSIONS

The arts in Thailand mirror the contradictions inherent in a society which values the traditions of the past but desires the fruits which accompany growth and change. Because the Thai elite, who are the usual patrons of the arts, do not yet understand the art of the modern world, contemporary Thai artists, many of whom have received their training in Western schools, find an infertile ground for their newly developed talents. Thus, Thai artists are faced with the problem of developing a modern Thai art that preserves the aesthetic values of the past yet acknowledges the themes and demands of the modern world. This contradiction is seen in the contemporary architecture of Bangkok. Buildings in the mode of classical Thai architecture required abundant space to accommodate the massive roofline, yet such space is normally unavailable in crowded Bangkok. The design

of modern buildings tends to reflect this major constraint (Devakul and Jumsai 1973, p. 19). Yet there are a number of modern buildings of great beauty which combine features of classical architecture with modern functional needs. The National Museum, the National Auditorium, and the Siam Intercontinental Hotel are cases in point. On the other hand, the Indra Regent Hotel combines the exterior beauty of the international school of architecture with the classical aesthetic qualities of its interior decor.

Artist colonies, such as the Mekpayab Art Centre, have sprung up in urban centers, often under the patronage of a royal princess. Modern art exhibits are opened by foreign ambassadors and are attended by increasing numbers of educated Thai and members of the international community. Hence, Thailand is being exposed to modern art and architecture. An indigenous film industry produces movies with epic story lines in which violent fighting, blood, lust, and stereotypical idealism are portrayed. The blend of the modern with the themes of the past has been commercially successful—as cinemas showing Thai features are consistently sold out. As of 1976 Thailand had no symphony orchestra, and the better military bands play Western music, at best badly. But this is because Thai musicians have not been well trained in Western instruments. No conservatory of music exists, and why should it? Only the international community has much appreciation for Western music, and it is too small to support a continuing orchestra. Yet folk music, which blends Thai, Chinese, and American ballads in melodies that are not dissonant to either the oriental or Western ear, has an immensely popular following.

Thailand is modernizing, but at a pace which accommodates her own needs. Reactions against the trend occasionally erupt. Leaders who are too materialistic and insufficiently Buddhist are overthrown, often after a prelude of subtle, indirect criticism through allegorical plays and skits. Anti-American and anti-Japanese feelings sometimes emerge when the rampant commercialism of the two foreign countries encroaches upon Thai identity and moral values and threatens Thai autonomy. Western progress, Western ideas, and Western art have been acceptable only when made compatible with Thai values. It is in this area that art can mediate the modernization of Thailand by developing recognizable symbols that link the beauty of the past with the beauty of the present.

Notes

1. To modernize and to develop a culture requires an initiation, adaptation, and management of change. See Daniel Lerner, *The Passing of Traditional Society: Modernizing the Middle East* (1958), and Everett Hagen, "How Economic Growth Begins: A Theory of Social Change" (1963, pp. 20–34).
2. Charles A. Murray attempts to answer an analogous question: "Why is it so much easier to get things done in one village than in another just down the road? . . . Why do villages react so differently to the problems of modernization and what is the nature of the differences?" Among other things, he notes "the underlying quality of life as being strategically important." *A Behavioral Study of Rural Modernization: Social and Economic Change in Thai Villages* (1977, p. viii).

3. "During long periods in human history, [art] was [created] by men who did not claim to be artists creating in beauty and who had no awareness that they were at the service of the beautiful, that masterworks in beauty were produced. . . . [The Indian, Chinese, and medieval artisans] considered themselves craftsmen, and they consciously sought only to do a good work." Jacques Maritain, *Creative Intuition in Art and Poetry* (1953, pp. 175–176).
4. After all, since craftsmen were obligated to reproduce the objects exactly, one Buddha or temple was as good as another, and new ones were better because all engaged in their production could earn more merit.
5. Ahlemeyer (1972, p. 8). Edward Voeller, writing in 1975 in the *Christian Science Monitor*, noted that twenty of these giant posters were exhibited in 1974 at the Museum of Modern Art in Paris and at the Cannes Film Festival.

References

Ahlemeyer, Marilyn. 1972. Movie Billboards. *Sawaddi* (Mar.–Apr.): 8.
Devakul, M. L. and Jumsai, Sumet. 1973. Directions in Thai Architecture. *Sawaddi* (Sept.–Oct.): 19.
Feroci, C. 1954. Traditional Thai Painting. *Siam Society Fiftieth Commemorative Edition*, vol. II. Bangkok: Siam Society, pp. 280–300.
Hagen, Everett. 1963. How Economic Growth Begins: A Theory of Social Change. *Journal of Social Issues* 19: 20–34.
Ingram, James C. 1971. *Economic Change in Thailand, 1850–1970*. Palo Alto, Calif.: Stanford Univ. Press.
Lerner, Daniel. 1958. *The Passing of Traditional Society: Modernizing the Middle East*. New York: The Free Press.
Maritain, Jacques. 1953. *Creative Intuition in Art and Poetry*. New York: Pantheon Books.
Murray, Charles A. 1977. *A Behavioral Study of Rural Modernization: Social and Economic Change in Thai Villages*. New York: Praeger.
National Statistical Office. 1973. *Population and Housing Census, 1970*.
Skinner, G. W. 1957. *Chinese Society in Thailand*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell Univ. Press.
Sponaugle, Judith B. 1972. The Design Development Program. *Sawaddi* (Mar.–Apr.): 15–18, 28–29.

Comment

Verna Hildebrand

As people interested in cultural economics, we have the objective of probing the linkages between economics and cultural expressions—all the "products" of art, literature, music, dance, drama, and cultural sites, both contemporary and historical. Through these individual and collective cultural expressions people of

each generation express themselves, find enjoyment, and gain a sense of the history of humanity. Economics links with cultural expressions as individuals and societies make decisions about allocating resources after assessing both the private and social costs and benefits resulting in a broad sense from various cultural expressions.

Values are concepts of the desirable, implicit in all cultural expressions and in a consumer's decision to purchase a work of art or attend a performance. Value assumptions are also involved in economic analysis. The value a society places on cultural expressions can be measured to some extent by the commitment of resources to cultural expressions by individuals and groups.

A human ecologist like myself customarily takes a holistic view, seeing the world as one large ecological system with dynamic interactions among three environments: (1) the natural environment, (2) the human-constructed environment, and (3) the human behavioral environment. The human behavioral environment includes the creators and the consumers of creative works. The human-constructed environment is exemplified in the economic, educational, religious, and political institutions which support artists and inspire their creations. The Mabry paper shows how political and economic life are tied to artistic expression. In one way or another the natural environment contributes resources for artistic works and for the support of artists and consumers of art. Also, in the case of Thailand, as reported by the Mabrys, the natural environment with its high humidity causes serious deterioration problems with certain art treasures.

The Mabrys' report on art in Thailand explains how artists' works are being incorporated into development plans, thus indicating a linkage between the political-economic institutions and creative expression. Political and creative freedom are closely related, as some Soviet artists clearly state today. In some ancient societies enjoying the arts was the privilege of royalty. Artists were conscripted to produce beautiful works which the artists and the common people were never privileged to enjoy. The Chinese often note this fact when they show visitors their historical museums and shrines. The Mabry paper mentions a similar attitude toward art in traditional Thailand.

The Western economic model and its related cognitive model widely used in education today appear to place a higher value on correct or convergent answers than on creative or divergent reasoning. This is exemplified by the fact that coaches and physics teachers are paid more than are music and art teachers, and when the funds are tight, art and music programs are cancelled or offered on a voluntary basis, thereby reducing both the prestige of the programs and the numbers of participating students. If we accept the argument posed by Mary and Bevars Mabry that artists can make an important contribution to economic development, then cutting back on creative arts programs is short-sighted, even in the narrow sense of economic development.

Art educators contend that creative expression developed in one medium is transferable to other media. Thus, new solutions to technical and social problems could be stimulated by individuals enjoying experiences in creative expression. It seems there are ample problems calling for creative solutions today. If such solu-

tions are deemed desirable, serious consideration should be given to increasing our efforts to support creative expression in all countries on the planet earth we share as a home.

In conclusion, both cultural economics and human ecology value a holistic perspective. Production and consumption of creative expressions by the people of the human behavioral environment merit the support of the institutions of the human-constructed environment.

Afterword